

Adroddiad ar gyfer	<b>Y Panel Gweithredol</b>
Dyddiad	<b>14 Mai 2018</b>
Swyddog Arweiniol	<b>Simon Smith, Prif Swyddog Tân</b>
Swyddog Cyswllt	<b>Shân Morris, Prif Swyddog Cynorthwyol (Polisi a Chynllunio Corfforaethol) 01745 535286</b>
Pwnc	<b>Cynllun Gwella a Llesiant 2019/20</b>



## **PWRPAS YR ADRODDIAD**

- 1 Ym mis Rhagfyr 2017, cytunodd Awdurdod Tân ac Achub (yr ATA) y byddai Gweithgor Cynllunio, yn cynnwys pob aelod o'i Banel Gweithredol, yn cynnal y gwaith manwl sy'n gysylltiedig â datblygu ei amcanion gwella a llesiant ar gyfer 2019/20.
- 2 Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi crynodeb o hynt y Gweithgor Cynllunio ac yn ceisio argymhelliad ffurfiol gan y Panel Gweithredol i'r ATA ar y dull y dylai ystyried ei fabwysiadu mewn perthynas â'i gynaliadwyedd ariannol tymor hir.

## **CRYNODEB GWEITHREDOL**

- 3 Mae'r ATA eisoes wedi mabwysiadu dau amcan llesiant tymor hir (gweler atodiad 1) ond bydd ei waith cynllunio tymor byr ar gyfer cyflawni'r amcanion hyn yn siŵr o gael eu dylanwadu gan benderfyniadau sy'n effeithio ar faint o arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yng Ngogledd Cymru.
- 4 Er mwyn cael Cynllun yn ei le erbyn Ebrill 2019/20 bydd angen i'r Awdurdod fod wedi ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd ar ei strategaeth arfaethedig dros yr haf a bod wedi gosod ei gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf erbyn Rhagfyr 2018. Yna, bydd Cynllun drafft 2019/20 yn cael ei baratoi i'w gymeradwyo'n derfynol gan yr ATA ym mis Mawrth 2019.
- 5 Yn ôl yr amcangyfrifon gorau o gostau rhedeg (refeniw) yr ATA, bydd cynnydd o £34,140,000 yn 2018/19 i £35,386,000 yn 2019/20. Dyma £1,246,000 o gynnydd yn y costau, Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddibyniaeth yn y gorffennol a nawr ar gronfeydd wrth gefn i osgoi cynyddu'r cyfraniadau gan awdurdodau lleol yn golygu mai'r gwahaniaeth rhwng lefel y cyfraniadau yn 2018/19 (£33,493,000) a chost gwasanaethau yn 2019/20 (£35,386,000) yw £1,893,000. Yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, mae cyfarfodydd y Gweithgor Cynllunio wedi bod yn canolbwyntio ar ariannu'r diffyg a ragwelir.

- 6 Mater i'r ATA yw penderfynu a yw am: a) cynyddu'r cyfraniadau yn unol â'r cyfanswm (sef £1,893,000 yn ychwanegol) er mwyn gallu parhau â lefelau cyfredol y gwasanaethau; neu b) leihau costau rhedeg yr ATA er mwyn lleihau'r angen i gael llai o swm o gynnydd yng nghyfraniadau'r awdurdodau cyfansoddol.
- 7 Bydd yr effaith ar y gwasanaeth tân ac achub o ran, er enghraifft, niferoedd y staff, gorsafoedd tân a pheiriannau tân yn ogystal â gwasanaethau atal ac amddiffyn, yn gysylltiedig yn uniongyrchol â strategaeth ariannu'r ATA ar gyfer 2019/20 ac wedi hynny.
- 8 Ond cyn gwneud penderfyniad cadarn am ddarparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn y dyfodol, rhaid i'r ATA roi digon o amser i'r cyhoedd a rhanddeiliaid eraill gael dweud eu dweud.
- 9 Felly, dylai argymhelliad y Panel Gweithredol i gyfarfod yr ATA ym mis Mehefin geisio cynorthwyo'r ATA llawn i benderfynu ar yr hyn y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn canolbwyntio arno yr haf yma. Bydd canlyniadau'r ymgynghoriad yn cael eu hystyried gan yr ATA yn yr hydref ac yn cael sylw wrth osod cyllideb 2019/20 ym mis Rhagfyr 2018 ac wrth baratoi Cynllun Gwella a Llesiant 2019/20 i'w gyhoeddi ym mis Mawrth 2019.

## **ARGYMHELLION**

- 10 Bod y Panel Gweithredol yn argymhell, i'r ATA yn ei gyfarfod ym mis Mehefin, gynnig drafft ar gyfer yr ymgynghoriad ar sail opsiynau i fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg a ragwelir mewn termau strategol, sef:
  - a) cael amcangyfrif o £1,898,000 o gynnydd yng nghyfanswm cyfunol y cyfraniad gan yr awdurdodau lleol yn 2019/20, ac felly gadw lefelau presennol y gwasanaethau tân ac achub yng Ngogledd Cymru; NEU
  - b) cael mymryn llai na £1,898,000 o gynnydd yng nghyfanswm y cyfunol y cyfraniad gan yr awdurdodau lleol, ac felly gadw'r prif wasanaethau tân ac achub yng Ngogledd Cymru ond bod angen gwneud rhai arbedion; NEU
  - c) cael llawer llai na £1,898,000 o gynnydd yng nghyfanswm cyfunol y cyfraniad gan yr awdurdodau lleol, felly bod angen gostyngiadau sylweddol yn y gwasanaethau tân ac achub yng Ngogledd Cymru.
- 11 Yn achos c) uchod, dylai'r Panel Gweithredol ddangos pa un yw'r opsiwn/opsiynau gorau ganddo ar gyfer cyflawni'r rhain, ar sail y rhestr a amlinellir ym mharagraff 50, a sydd hefyd wedi'u cynnwys mewn mwy o fanylder yn atodiad 2 a gaiff ei gynnwys yn y ddogfen ymgynghoriad.

- 12 Bod y Panel Gweithredol yn enwebu un aelod (ac un wrth gefn) i gyflwyno'r adroddiad sy'n nodi argymhelliad y Panel Gweithredol i'r ATA yn ei gyfarfod ym mis Mehefin.

## **SYLWADAU'R PANEL GWEITHREDOL/PWYLLGOR ARCHWILIO**

- 13 Nid yw'r adroddiad hwn wedi cael ei ystyried gan yr Aelodau o'r blaen.

## **CEFNDIR**

- 14 Rhaid i'r Awdurdod gyhoeddi amcanion gwella blynyddol yn unol â Mesur Llywodraeth Leol 2009. Rhaid iddo hefyd gyhoeddi amcanion llesiant tymor hir yn unol â Deddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol 2015 a chymryd pob cam rhesymol (wrth gyflawni ei swyddogaethau) i gyflawni'r amcanion hynny.
- 15 Mae disgwyl i'r ATA gynnwys pobl eraill yn y broses o benderfynu ar ei amcanion ar gyfer y dyfodol ac ymgynghori cyn gwneud penderfyniadau terfynol. Fel arfer, ystyrir bod 12 wythnos o gyfnod ymgynghori yn gyfnod priodol yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, er bod modd amrywio hyn. Mae disgwyl hefyd fod ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus yn cael ei cynnal yn unol ag egwyddorion penodol (gweler atodiad 3).
- 16 Roedd adroddiad i'r Panel Gweithredol ym mis Chwefror 2018 yn rhoi crynodeb o'r amserlen arfaethedig ar gyfer gosod a chyhoeddi amcanion ar gyfer 2019/20 yn unol â'r ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol. Mae amserlen gryno ddiwygiedig (gweler atodiad 4) yn nodi'r camau ar gyfer paratoi Cynllun yr Awdurdod ar gyfer 2019/20 a'r gwaith cysylltiedig o osod y gyllideb ar gyfer ei gyflawni.
- 17 O ran sicrhau cyllid, mae'r rhan fwyaf o incwm refeniw'r Awdurdod yn cael ei greu ar ffurf cyfraniadau ariannol gan bob un o awdurdodau lleol Gogledd Cymru yn unol ag amcangyfrif o'i boblogaeth (gweler atodiad 5).
- 18 Mae'r ATA yn gweithredu ar sail cyllideb fantoledig, ac ystyr hyn yn fras yw codi digon o arian ar gyfer y flwyddyn i dalu ei wariant arian parod yn ystod y flwyddyn. O raid, bydd maint cyllideb yr ATA yn penderfynu beth fydd maint ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau tân ac achub y mae'n gallu eu darparu a beth yw maint unrhyw arbedion y bydd eu hangen i osgoi gwario mwy nag sydd ar gael.
- 19 O dan delerau Gorchymyn Gwasanaethau Tân Gogledd Cymru (Cynllun Cyfuno) 1995 (gweler atodiad 6), rhaid i'r ATA gyflwyno, i'w awdurdodau cyfansoddol, erbyn 31 Rhagfyr 2018, amcangyfrif o'i dreuliau net ar gyfer 2019/20, ac yna gadarnhau'r union swm cyn 15 Chwefror 2019. Petai'r ATA yn wynebu diffyg annisgwyl yn ei gyllideb refeniw yn ystod y flwyddyn, mae telerau'r Gorchymyn Cyfuno yn caniatáu ar gyfer adfer diffyg o'r math hwn drwy ardoll atodol ar yr awdurdodau lleol.

## CYFLWYNIAD

- 20 Yn ystod cyfarfodydd y Gweithgor Cynllunio, mae'r aelodau wedi cael cyflwyniadau a gwybodaeth am sefyllfa ariannol yr ATA ac maent wedi ystyried amrediad o opsiynau posibl ar gyfer parhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub fforddiadwy. Yn atodiad 7, ceir crynodeb o'r materion a gafodd eu hystyried yng nghyfarfodydd y Gweithgor Cynllunio.
- 21 Yn atodiad 2, ceir rhestr o'r opsiynau posibl ar gyfer gwneud newidiadau sylweddol i wasanaethau tân ac achub fel y bu'r Gweithgor Cynllunio yn eu hystyried. Penderfynodd y Gweithgor Cynllunio ei fod eisiau i'r Panel Gweithredol gael cyfle i dderbyn neu wrthod pob opsiwn, gan gynnwys yr opsiwn a ystyriwyd o'r blaen sef tynnu un peiriant amser cyflawn o Wrecsam, os penderfynir mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg a ragwelir yn y gyllideb drwy gyfuniad o ostyngiadau yn y gwasanaethau a chyfraniadau uwch gan yr awdurdodau lleol.

## Y SEFYLLFA ARIANNOL

- 22 Mae ATAAu yng Nghymru yn cael eu hariannu'n bennaf drwy gyfraniadau gan awdurdodau lleol tuag at gost darparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub (gweler atodiad 5).
- 23 Am y rhan fwyaf o'r degawd diwethaf, mae'r cyni ariannol yn y sector cyhoeddus wedi effeithio'n ddifrifol ar ATA Gogledd Cymru. Ers 2011/12, mae'r ATA wedi gwneud mwy na £3 miliwn o arbedion o'r gyllideb refeniw (tua 10%) ac mae wedi gweld gostyngiad o 9% yng ngweithlu'r Gwasanaeth. Fel yr adroddodd y Gweithgor Cynllunio, mae'r newidiadau i'r Gwasanaeth wedi cynnwys y canlynol: gostwng cyllidebau staffio; ailstrwythuro, a chael gwared ar swyddi rheoli; trosglwyddo swyddi i delerau ac amodau gwahanol; a chanslo/lleihau gwariant a gynlluniwyd. Llwyddwyd i wneud llawer o'r newidiadau – yn enwedig y rhai yn y blynyddoedd cyntaf o gyni – heb fawr o effaith amlwg ar y gwasanaethau ymateb brys traddodiadol. Ond yn y diwedd, cyflwynwyd newidiadau yr oedd y cyhoedd yn gallu eu gweld (e.e. newid y polisi ar ymateb i alwadau a ddaw gan larymau tân awtomatig a rhoi'r gorau i ymateb i alwadau'n ymwneud ag achub anifeiliaid ac achub â rhaffau).
- 24 Mae ATA Gogledd Cymru wedi cyfrannu at y mesurau cyni drwy rewi ei gyllideb rhwng 2011/12 a 2014/15 a gwneud arbedion i lyfnhau'r cynnydd a ragwelir yn y costau. Yn 2015/16, cafwyd cynnydd bach o ryw £113k. Yn 2016/17, yn hytrach na chynyddu cyfraniadau gan yr awdurdodau lleol, neilltuodd yr ATA £740,000 o gronfeydd wrth gefn i danategu diffyg a ragwelid yn ei gyllideb y flwyddyn honno.

- 25 Yn ystod 2016, penderfynodd yr ATA newid ei strategaeth wreiddiol, sef rhewi ei gyllideb, i gyllideb ariannol a oedd yn cyfuno tair elfen, sef defnyddio cronfeydd wrth gefn, cynyddu'r cyfraniadau ariannol a lleihau gwasanaethau. Cafodd hyn ei wneud ar y sail na fyddai cynyddu'r bwch cyllido a lleihau cronfeydd wrth gefn yn rhywbeth cynaliadwy fel strategaeth.
- 26 Argymhelliad y Panel Gweithredol i'r Awdurdod Llawn ym Mehefin 2016 oedd y dylai'r ATA, o ragweld bwch cyllido gwerth £2.26 miliwn erbyn 2019/20 a chronfeydd yn lleihau, fabwysiadu strategaeth ariannol 3 blynedd a fyddai'n gweld £1.36 miliwn o gynnydd yn y cyfraniadau, a gweld £0.9 miliwn o leihad yng nghostau rhedeg y gwasanaeth tân ac achub.
- 27 Cydnabuwyd y byddai cael £900,000 o ostyngiad yn y costau rhedeg yn siŵr o olygu gostwng nifer y diffoddwyr tân sy'n cael eu cyflogi a byddai hyn yn golygu amser i ddigwydd. Yn gyndyn iawn, daeth yr aelodau i'r casgliad mai tynnu'r ail beiriant tân llawn amser o Wreccsam a dadsefydlu 24 o swyddi fyddai'r opsiwn "lleiaf gwael" i wneud yr arbedion angenrheidiol ond roeddent wedi'u bodloni bod y proffil ymddeol a ddisgwylir dros y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf yn golygu bod y gostyngiad hwn yn bosibl heb fod angen dileu swyddi diffoddwyr tân amser cyflawn yn orfodol. Daeth yr aelodau i'r casgliad hefyd fod yr opsiwn hwn yn gynnig mwy derbyniol na chael gwared ar ofal tân o gymunedau cyfan drwy gau 8-10 o orsafoedd tân RDS a dileu swyddi diffoddwyr tân RDS yn orfodol.
- 28 Byddai'r strategaeth dair blynedd newydd hon yn addas ar gyfer yr Awdurdod rhwng 2017/18 a 2019/20. Ac er y byddai'n golygu cynnydd sylweddol yn y cyfraniadau yn 2017/18 (o ryw £1.36 miliwn) byddai hyn yn cael ei ddilyn gan ddwy flynedd (2018/19 a 2019/20) o gyllideb wedi'i rhewi wrth i'r gostyngiadau i wasanaethau gael effaith.
- 29 Yn Rhagfyr 2016, gan wynebu costau ychwanegol annisgwyl (e.e. yr ardoll prentisiaethau) bu'r ATA yn ystyried cynnig i gael £1.7 miliwn o gynnydd yn y cyfraniadau (+5.3%) ar gyfer 2017/18, sef £414,000 yn fwy nag a drafodwyd yn wreiddiol. Yn hytrach, penderfynodd yr ATA gyfyngu'r cynnydd i £1.275 miliwn (+4%) a neilltuo £414,000 o gronfeydd wrth gefn i ariannu'r diffyg yn y flwyddyn honno. Yn hytrach na rhewi'r gyllideb yn 2018/19, gellid edrych eto, yn nes at yr amser, ar yr angen am £414,000 arall (sy'n cyfateb i'r 1.3% sy'n weddill).
- 30 Ym mis Mawrth 2017, o wynebu rhywfaint o wrthwynebiad i'r posibilrwydd o dynnu un peiriant amser cyflawn o orsaf dân Wreccsam, fe wnaeth yr ATA dynnu'r opsiwn o wneud hyn fel ffordd o gael £0.9 miliwn o ostyngiad yn y costau rhedeg, a gadael unrhyw benderfyniad ynglŷn â gostwng gwasanaethau i'r ATA a fyddai'n bodoli ar ôl yr etholiadau llywodraeth leol ym mis Mai 2017.

- 31 Ym mis Rhagfyr 2017, bu'r ATA newydd yn ystyried y strategaeth ariannol tymor canolig ar gyfer 2018-21 a'r gofyniad a amcangyfrifir o ran y gyllideb, sef £978,300 yn ychwanegol yn 2018/19. Roedd adroddiad y Trysorydd yn cyfeirio at bwysau costau yn y dyfodol, gan gynnwys ailbrisio cynlluniau pensiwn y diffoddwyr tân yn 2018 a'r gwariant sy'n gysylltiedig â symud i systemau cysylltiadau cenedlaethol newydd. Dewisodd yr ATA ariannu'r gofyniad ychwanegol drwy gael £331,600 (1%) o gynnydd yn y cyfraniadau a dyrannu'r £646,700 sy'n weddill o gronfeydd wrth gefn.
- 32 Er bod defnyddio cronfeydd wrth gefn yn ddyfais bosibl ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â phroblemau cyllidebol, nid yw'r ffynhonnell gyllid hon yn cael ei hadnewyddu bob blwyddyn yn yr un ffordd ag y mae'r gyllideb refeniw. Felly, oni bai fod y costau rhedeg yn cael eu gostwng y flwyddyn wedyn, bydd cyllideb y flwyddyn honno yn gweld cynnydd yn y swm a oedd wedi cael ei thanategu gan y cronfeydd wrth gefn.
- 33 Erbyn hyn, mae'r cronfeydd sydd gan yr ATA wrth gefn yn cyrraedd yr isafswm y mae'r Trysorydd yn ei ystyried yn ddarbodus (y terfyn absoliwt yw 2% o'r gyllideb refeniw net), gan gyfyngu ar y gallu i'w defnyddio fel rhan o strategaeth o osod y gyllideb.
- 34 Felly, wrth nesáu at 2019/20, mae'r ATA yn wynebu effaith gronnol penderfyniadau'r gorffennol i ariannu diffygion drwy gronfeydd wrth gefn nad oeddent wedi cael eu dyrannu, codiadau cyflog a chwyddiant cyffredinol dros amser, a'r penderfyniad i beidio â dechrau cynllunio i sicrhau £900,000 o ostyngiad yn y costau rhedeg fel y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol ar gyfer 2018/19.
- 35 Dylid nodi bod llai o gyfle i leihau'r gweithlu drwy gyfraddau ymadael erbyn hyn. Yn 2016/17, fe wnaeth un deg saith o ddiffoddwyr tân amser cyflawn adael y Gwasanaeth. Er nad oes oedran ymddeol pendant, rhagwelir mai dim ond chwech o ddiffoddwyr tân a allai ymddeol yn 2019/20.
- 36 Yn ôl yr amcangyfrifon gorau o dreuliau'r ATA ar gyfer 2019/20, bydd angen cyfanswm o £35,386,000 o refeniw. Os caiff hyn ei ariannu'n llwyr drwy gyfraniadau'r awdurdodau lleol, bydd hynny'n golygu cynnydd o £1,893,000. O'i rannu allan i'r awdurdodau lleol, byddai'r cynnydd tua £180,360 - £398,160 i bob awdurdod (£315,500 ar gyfartaledd).
- 37 Yn ôl yr amcangyfrifon diweddaraf, byddai cynghorau sir Gogledd Cymru 2018/19 yn cyfrannu rhwng 2.35% a 2.86% o gyfanswm eu cyllidebau tuag at gost darparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn yr ardal (2.55% ar gyfartaledd). Drwy gyfrannu 0.08% arall o gyfraniadau'r cynghorau sir, byddai £1 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer hynny. Felly, byddai cynyddu'r cyfraniad cyfartalog i 2.71% o gyfanswm cyllidebau'r cynghorau sir wedi ychwanegu dros £2 filiwn at gyllideb yr ATA yn 2018/19.

## EFFEITHIAU MEWNOL YR ARBEDION

- 38 Mae'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd sy'n rhyddhau arian parod a gafwyd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf (gweler atodiad 8) wedi cael effaith sylweddol, sy'n para amser maith, ar y Gwasanaeth. Mae'r gostyngiad yn y staff wedi arwain at osod mwy o alwadau ar y rhai sy'n aros, ac mae datblygiadau wedi golygu bod aelodau o'r Gwasanaeth yn treulio llawer o amser yn gwasanaethau gofynion allanol, nad yw pob un yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â darparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub. Rhai enghreifftiau diweddar yw Safonau newydd y Gymraeg, y Rheoliad GDPR (Rheoliad Diogelu Data Cyffredinol) a Deddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol 2015.
- 39 Er mwyn amddiffyn gwasanaethau ymateb brys, mae'r baich o ryddhau llawer o'r arbedion y cyfeirir atynt uchod wedi syrthio ar waith sy'n cefnogi'r gwasanaethau "rheng flaen" hynny. Y canlyniad fu pwysau mawr ar gapasiti, nid yn unig mewn gwaith gweinyddol "cefn swyddfa" ond hefyd mewn gwasanaethau sy'n darparu cefnogaeth uniongyrchol i'r gwasanaethau ymateb brys ac mewn swyddi rheolwyr gweithredol. Mae'r Prif Swyddog Tân wedi rhoi gwybod i'r aelodau yn ffurfiol y byddai unrhyw ostyngiadau pellach yn yr olaf yn peryglu systemau gwaith diogel, gan olygu perygl difrifol i ddiogelwch staff gweithredol a chynyddu'r perygl i'r ATA ei hun yn gyfreithiol ac o ran ei enw da.
- 40 Effeithiwyd hefyd ar waith diogelwch tân cymunedol a diogelwch tân busnesau er bod yr ATA wedi ymrwymo'n gadarn i'r agenda ataliol. Er enghraifft, ar ôl cael trafferth cyrraedd targed yr ATA o gynnal 30,000 o archwiliadau diogelwch yn y cartref bob blwyddyn, cafodd y targed ei ostwng yn y diwedd i 20,000 yn 2015/16.
- 41 Yn gryno, er y bydd y swyddogion yn gallu parhau i chwilio am arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn y gwaith nad yw'r cyhoedd yn ei weld yn uniongyrchol, y gwirionedd yw bod maint y diffyg a ragwelir yn y gyllideb yn 2019/20 yn gofyn am fwy na'r hyn y gellir ei wneud o'r ffynonellau hyn yn unig. Felly, byddai cyllido'r diffyg drwy leihau'r costau rhedeg yn gorfod bod yn rhan o strategaeth ehangach sy'n cynnwys cynyddu'r cyfraniadau gan yr awdurdodau lleol.
- 42 Ni fyddai gohirio gwariant arfaethedig (e.e. ar waith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw) yn lleihau'r gost waelodol o ddarparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn yr ardal. Fel y byddai gohirio cynnydd yn y cyfraniadau drwy ddefnyddio cronfeydd wrth gefn, byddai'r costau hyn yn parhau a byddai angen cael y swm hwnnw o gynnydd yn y gyllideb yn y blynyddoedd i ddod pan fyddai angen cael y gwariant a ohiriwyd.
- 43 Mae cynaliadwyedd ariannol yr ATA yn dibynnu bellach ar sicrhau cynnydd yn y cyfraniadau gan yr awdurdodau lleol a/neu gael gostyngiad parhaol yng nghostau rhedeg y gwasanaeth heb orfod dibynnu ar gronfeydd wrth gefn nad ydynt wedi'u dyrannu fel ateb tymor byr i sicrhau cyllideb fantoledig.

## ASESU RISG/EFFAITH

- 44 Mae'r dyraniad adnoddau cyfredol ar draws ardal Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru wedi aros yn gymharol ddigyfnewid ers creu'r Gwasanaeth yn 1996. Mae'r un 44 o orsafoedd tân ar gael ag a oedd o'r blaen. Cafwyd rhai newidiadau yn nhrefniadaeth peiriannau, yn fwyaf arbennig yn nifer y Peiriannau ALP o 4 i 3 yn 2011/12. Hefyd, cafwyd rhai newidiadau yn y math o ymateb a roddir, yn fwyaf arbennig y newid polisi yn 2015/16 o ran ymateb i alwadau a ddaw gan larymau tân awtomatig ar rai mathau o safleoedd.
- 45 Mae rhai sylwedyddion o'r farn y dylai'r gostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y tanau dros y degawd diwethaf olygu y dylid cael gostyngiad cyfochrog yn yr adnoddau sydd eu hangen. Byddai pobl eraill yn dadlau mai polisi yswiriant yw'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub ac er nad yw efallai'n cael ei alw at gynifer o danau ag o'r blaen fe ddylai'r ymateb fod yr un fath ag y mae wedi bod erioed. Er hynny, mae pobl eraill yn cyfeirio at gymhlethdod ychwanegol gwasanaethau tân ac achub heddiw ac yn dadlau mai rhywbeth rhy gul yw cymharu ar sail nifer y tanau rydyn ni'n mynd atynt bob blwyddyn.
- 46 Dadleuir o blaid ailgyflunio'r Gwasanaeth yn yr un ffordd ac y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gorfod ei wneud er mwyn sicrhau arbedion costau. Nid yw'r dull hwn o reidrydd yn cyd-berthyn oherwydd bod digwyddiadau brys yn amhosib i'w rhagweld o ran eu hunion leoliad, sut maen nhw'n digwydd a pha mor ddifrifol ydyn nhw (gan effeithio ar faint o adnoddau sydd eu hangen, ac am faint o amser).
- 47 Mater cymhleth yw asesu'r risg sy'n gysylltiedig â thynnu adnoddau. Hyd yn oed oes yw gorsaf dân wedi cael lefel isel iawn o weithgaredd, mae posibl o hyd y bydd yna ddigwydd sydd angen ymateb amserol a chydgyfeiriol. Yn anochel, bydd tynnu adnodd yn cynyddu'r risg mewn rhyw ffordd felly rhaid i unrhyw benderfyniad i dynnu adnoddau er mwyn cwrdd â diffyg yn y gyllideb ystyried a yw'r risg sy'n cael ei greu gan y weithred honno yn risg derbyniol y mae modd ei gyfiawnhau.
- 48 Felly hefyd, dylid cofio nad yw'r risg wedi'i gyfyngu i'r ardal lle roedd yr adnodd i'w gael o'r blaen. Nid yw peiriannau Gogledd Cymru yn gweithredu yng nghyffiniau eu gorsaf gartref yn unig. Gellir eu hanfon unrhyw bryd i unrhyw leoliad yng Ngogledd Cymru neu mewn ardaloedd cyfagos, naill ai i fynd at ddigwyddiad neu i lenwi bwlch dros dro yn y gofal. Felly, byddai cau gorsaf dân neu dynnu peiriant tân (sef i ostwng nifer y diffoddwyr tân sy'n cael eu cyflogi) yn cael effaith ar lefel gyffredinol y gofal sy'n cael ei ddarparu yng Ngogledd Cymru. Yn yr amgylchiadau mwyaf difrifol, byddai'n peryglu gallu'r Gwasanaeth i ymateb mewn modd derbyniol.



## CRYNODEB O'R OPSIYNAU SYDD AR GAEL

- 49 Yn ei gyfarfod ar 19 Mawrth 2018, penderfynodd y Gweithgor Cynllunio ei fod eisiau i'r opsiynau posibl gael eu hystyried yng nghyfarfod y Panel Gweithredol ym mis Mai 2018 er mwyn naill ai derbyn neu wrthod pob un. Yn ddibynnol ar gymeradwyaeth yr ATA, fe ellid wedyn ymgorffori'r opsiynau derbyniol yn yr ymgynghoriad yn yr haf gyda'r opsiwn a ystyriwyd yn 'lleiaf gwael' o'r blaen, sef tynnu peiriant o Wrecsam gan dalu'r diffyg yn y gyllideb drwy gynnydd yng nghyfraniadau'r awdurdodau lleol.
- 50 Yn gryno, roedd yr opsiynau'n ymwneud â mabwysiadau un neu ragor o'r canlynol:
- tynnu'r ail beiriant tân amser cyflawn o Wrecsam;
  - newid oriau'r ail beiriant tân yn Wrecsam i ofalu am oriau'r dydd yn unig, ac nid dros nos;
  - troi gorsafoedd shifftiau 24 awr Glannau Dyfrdwy a/neu'r Rhyl yn orsafoedd staff dydd yn unig (a throi'n ofal RDS yn unig dros nos);
  - troi un neu ragor o orsafoedd criw dydd yn orsafoedd y system RDS (ar gael yn ôl y galw);
  - dileu'r lwfansau criw dydd sy'n cael eu talu ar hyn o bryd i ddiffoddwyr tân criw dydd;
  - cau un neu ragor o orsafoedd tân y system RDS;
  - tynnu'r peiriant RDS o un neu ragor o'r wyth gorsaf amser cyflawn;
  - dim un o'r uchod, ac ariannu'r holl swm ychwanegol drwy gynnyddu'r cyfraniadau gan yr awdurdodau lleol.
- 51 Yr hyn yr oedd orau gan rai o aelodau'r Gweithgor Cynllunio oedd argymhell i'r ATA y dylai gwrdd yn rhannol â'r diffyg a amcangyfrifir drwy gynnydd o ryw £1 miliwn yn y cyfraniadau ynghyd â gostyngiadau yng nghostau rhedeg y gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Roedd rhai eraill yn ystyried y byddai dewis cynyddu'r cyfraniadau i dalu'r holl ddiffyg, sef £1.893 miliwn, yn gynnig derbyniol.
- 52 Cafodd yr aelodau eu hatgoffa y byddai'n cymryd nifer o flynyddoedd i weithredu'r newidiadau felly ni fyddai modd cael yr arbedion ar unwaith ar ôl penderfynu cau gorsafoedd tân a/neu dynnu peiriannau tân, nid yn unig oherwydd yr amser sydd ei angen i ddileu swyddi diffoddwyr tân. Roedd y Trysorydd yn cynghori y gallai fod angen defnyddio cronfeydd wrth gefn ar gyfer hyn er mwyn pontio'r diffyg yn y cyfamser.

- 53 Roedd y Gweithgor Cynllunio yn cydnabod hefyd fod y dasg o amcangyfrif cost darparu gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn y blynyddoedd i ddod yn parhau i gael ei gymhlethu gan bwysau costau hysbys yn y dyfodol ond nad oes modd o wybod faint fydd y gost mewn gwirionedd. Er enghraifft, goblygiadau'r gwaith o ailbrisio pensiynau a chost Rhwydwaith y Gwasanaethau Brys (ESN) – sef y prosiect cenedlaethol i gyflwyno'r system gysylltiadau newydd sy'n cael ei defnyddio gan y tri gwasanaeth brys a defnyddwyr eraill yn y DU ym maes diogelwch y cyhoedd.

## GOBLYGIADAU

Amcanion Llesiant	Goblygiad uniongyrchol wrth gytuno ar y camau tuag ag amcanion llesiant tymor hir yr Awdurdod.
Cyllideb	Mae perthynas bendant rhwng cynlluniau'r Awdurdod ar gyfer 2019/20 a lefel yr adnoddau ariannol sydd ar gael. Rhaid cytuno ar y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2019/20 ym mis Rhagfyr 2018 a'i chadarnhau erbyn canol Chwefror 2019.
Cyfreithiol	Mae'n cefnogi cydymffurfiaeth â deddfwriaeth ym maes llesiant a chynllunio gwelliannau.
Staffio	Bydd yr effaith ar lefelau staffio yn dibynnu ar benderfyniad yr ATA yn y pen draw, ond ni ellir canfod unrhyw oblygiadau uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad hwn.
Cydraddoldeb/Hawliau Dynol/Y Gymraeg	Bydd yr effaith ar yr agweddau hyn yn cael ei hasesu'n llawn yn unol â phenderfyniad yr ATA yn y pen draw, ond ni ellir canfod unrhyw oblygiadau uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad hwn.
Risgiau	Cafodd y risgiau posibl eu hystyried yng nghorff yr adroddiad, ond bydd angen asesiad pellach fel rhan o broses benderfynu derfynol yr ATA.

## APPENDICES

1	North Wales FRA well-being objectives
2	Planning Working Group options report
3	Gunning principles for public consultation
4	Summary timetable for producing the FRA's 2019/20 Plan
5	Recent contributions from local authorities towards the cost of fire and rescue services
6	Extracts from the North Wales Combination Scheme Order 1995
7	Summary of Planning Working Group 2018 meetings
8	Summary of savings and efficiencies already achieved

### **Well-being Objectives**

North Wales Fire and Rescue Authority's long-term well-being objectives are:

- A. To support people to prevent accidental dwelling fires and stay safe if they do occur;
- B. To facilitate high quality, responsive and better integrated fire and rescue services so that prevention activity and emergency response can continue to be available when and where required, affordably, equitably and on the basis of risk.

Various options for addressing the anticipated shortfall were considered by the Planning Working Group. The Group decided that it wanted the Executive Panel to consider each option at its May meeting together with the option of fully funding the shortfall through increased contributions from the local authorities.

**PLANNING WORKING GROUP**  
**DISCUSSION PAPER 19/03/2018**

**Typical pay costs (used for calculation estimates):**

	Wholetime Duty System (WDS)		Retained Duty System (RDS)*	
	24-hour shift	Day crewing	100% contract	75% contract
Watch Manager B	£48,082			
Watch Manager A	£45,148	£50,717	£6,959	£5,580
Crew Manager	£42,997	£48,459	£6,222	£5,314
Firefighter	£38,782	£44,034	£5,612	£4,793

\*Includes retainer and drill fees, but not incident fees.

**Remove the 2nd WDS fire appliance from Wrexham:**

From:	4 X 1 = 4 WM B	£192,329
Two appliances	4 X 3 = 12 CM	£515,965
	4 X 9 = 36 FF	£1,396,170
		<b>£2,104,464</b>
To:	4 X 1 = 4 WM A	£180,591
One appliance	4 X 2 = 8 CM	£343,977
	4 X 4 = 16 FF	£620,520
		<b>£1,145,088</b>

**Savings:**

WM (reduced pay)	-£11,738
CM (4 fewer employed)	-£171,988
FF (20 fewer employed)	-£775,650
	<b>-£959,376</b>

**Estimated one-off cost of statutory redundancy payments (total):****£127,140 (excluding notice period)****OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)****Associated savings:**

Fleet (e.g. cost of maintenance and replacement of 1 fire appliance and on-board equipment).  
 Staff (e.g. personal equipment, training, ICT and employment administration of 24 employees).

**Legal implications:**

Need to ensure fair processes for up to 24 firefighter redundancies (consultation, selection criteria, business grounds for redundancy, alternatives, etc) and for reducing the pay of 4 Watch Managers from B (higher paid) to A (lower paid).  
 Need to ensure sufficient consultation with stakeholders ("Gunning principles").

**Potential for:**

- Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);
- Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the removal;
- Predicted savings not achieved – e.g. only part-year savings achieved while discussions/challenges continue; pay increases negotiated nationally;
- Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and employment-related);
- Increased workloads associated with redundancy and pay reduction processes;
- Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest;
- Increased workloads associated with adapting mobilising and/or other protocols following the permanent removal of the appliance;
- Increased use of/reliance on the remaining appliances/operational equipment;
- Increased use of/reliance on the remaining crews at Wrexham and/or nearby fire stations (the closest ones are retained stations at Johnstown, Llangollen, Chirk and Buckley);
- Longer attendance times (additional time for RDS crew to arrive at the station);
- Heavier reliance on maintaining full RDS cover in the area (recruitment and retention challenge);
- Reduced Service capacity to undertake future (possibly new) duties/collaboration;
- (Criticism of) under-use of the fire station facility in Wrexham;
- Smaller pool of wholetime firefighters to progress into specialist/management roles.

**Change the hours of the 2nd WDS fire appliance in Wrexham (to daytime only, not overnight):**

From:	4 X 1 = 4 WM B	£192,329
Two appliances on 2:2:4	4 X 3= 12 CM	£515,965
	4 X 9 = 36 FF	£1,396,170
		<b>£2,104,464</b>
To:	4 X 1 = 4 WM A	£180,591
One appliance on 2:2:4 (four shifts)	4 X 2 = 8 CM	£343,977
	4 X 4= 16 FF	£620,520
		<b>£1,145,088</b>
and		
One appliance on 4 on 4 off (two shifts)	2 X 1 = 2 WM A	£90,296
calculated at 24-hour shift pay rates	2 X 2 = 4 CM	£171,988
	2 X 4 = 8 FF	£310,260
		<b>£572,544</b>
		<b>£1,717,632</b>
<b>Savings:</b>		
	WM (on the basis of 2 additional)	+£78,557
	CM (same number required)	£0
	FF (12 fewer employed)	-£465,390
		<b>-£386,833</b>

**Estimated one-off cost of statutory redundancy payments (total):****£48,900 (excluding notice period)****OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)****Associated savings:**

Staff (e.g. personal equipment, training, ICT and employment administration of 10 employees).

**Legal implications:**

Need to ensure fair processes for making staff redundant (consultation, selection criteria, business grounds for redundancy, alternatives, etc) and for reducing Watch Manager posts from B (higher paid) to A. New untried “day staffing” contract would have to be negotiated. (Applying day crewing rates instead of the 24-hour shift rates to the day staffed pump would reduce the savings from £386,833 to £311,830).

**Potential for:**

- Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);
- Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the change;
- Predicted savings not achieved – e.g. only part-year savings achieved while discussions/challenges continue; “day staffing” pay rates and allowances higher than assumed; national pay negotiations;
- Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and pay/employment-related);
- Increased workloads associated with redundancy and pay negotiation processes;
- Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest;
- Increased workloads associated with adapting mobilising and/or other protocols for night-time;
- Increased use of/reliance on the remaining crews at Wrexham and/or nearby fire stations at night (the closest ones are retained stations at Johnstown, Llangollen, Chirk and Buckley);
- Longer attendance times at night (additional time for RDS crew to arrive at the station);
- Heavier reliance on maintaining full RDS cover in the area at night (recruitment and retention challenge);
- Slightly reduced Service capacity to undertake future (possibly new) duties/collaboration;
- Smaller pool of wholetime firefighters to progress into specialist/management roles.

**Change Deeside and/or Rhyl 24-hour shift to day staffing only (to retained cover only at night)**

From:		
	4 X 1 = 4 WM A	£180,591
One appliance, 4 shifts	4 X 2 = 8 CM	£343,977
	4 X 4 = 16 FF	£620,520
		<b>£1,145,088</b>
To:		
	2 X 1 = 2 WM A	£90,296
One appliance, 2 shifts	2 X 2 = 4 CM	£171,988
calculated at 24-hour shift pay rates	2 X 4 = 8 FF	£310,260
		<b>£572,544</b>

**Savings:**

WM (2 fewer employed)	-£90,296
CM (4 fewer employed)	-£171,988
FF (8 fewer employed)	-£310,260
	<b>-£572,544</b>

**Estimated one-off cost of statutory redundancy payments (total) for each station:**

**£88,509 (excluding notice period)**

**OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)**

**Associated savings:**

Staff (e.g. personal equipment, training, ICT and employment administration of 14 employees).

**Legal implications:**

Need to ensure fair processes for making staff redundant (consultation, selection criteria, business grounds for redundancy, alternatives, etc).

New untried "day staffing" contract would have to be negotiated. (Applying day crewing rates instead of 24-hour shift rates would reduce the savings from £572,544 to £497,542).

**Potential for:**

- Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);
- Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the change;
- Complaints from firefighters who live far away from the fire station (relocation costs);
- Predicted savings not achieved – e.g. only part-year savings achieved while discussions/challenges continue; "day staffing" pay rates and allowances higher than assumed; national pay negotiations;
- Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and pay/employment-related);
- Increased workloads associated with redundancy and pay negotiation processes;
- Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest;
- Increased workloads associated with adapting mobilising and/or other protocols for night-time;
- Increased use of/reliance on the retained crews at Deeside and/or nearby fire stations at night (the closest ones are retained stations at Flint, Holywell, Mold and Buckley.);
- Longer attendance times at night (additional time for RDS crew to arrive at the station);
- Heavier reliance on maintaining full RDS cover in the area at night (recruitment and retention challenge);
- Slightly reduced Service capacity to undertake future (possibly new) duties/collaboration;
- Smaller pool of wholetime firefighters to progress into specialist/management roles.



**Change one or more day crewed stations to retained duty system (RDS)**

Day crewed stations are at Holyhead, Caernarfon, Bangor, Llandudno and Colwyn Bay. Each one has a day crewed appliance and a retained appliance. This calculation is based on removing the day crewed appliance and keeping the retained appliance as it is.

From:

	2 X 1 = 2 WM A	£101,435
One day crewed appliance, 2 shifts	2 X 2 = 4 CM	£193,838
Plus RDS appliance (not costed here)	2 X 4 = 8 FF	£352,273
		<b>£647,546</b>

To:

(RDS crew only, employment costs unchanged)

**Savings per day crewed station:**

	WM (2 fewer employed)	-£101,435
<i>Calculation does not take increased RDS</i>	CM (4 fewer employed)	-£193,838
<i>incident fees (paid per incident) into account</i>	FF (8 fewer employed)	-£352,273
		<b>-£647,546</b>

**Estimated one-off cost of statutory redundancy payments (total) for each station:**

**£88,509 (excluding notice period)**

**OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)****Associated savings:**

Staff (e.g. personal equipment, training, ICT and employment administration of 14 employees at each station).

**Legal implications:**

Need to ensure fair processes for making staff redundant (consultation, selection criteria, business grounds for redundancy, alternatives, etc).

**Potential for:**

- Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);
- Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the change;
- Predicted savings not achieved – e.g. only part-year savings achieved while discussions/challenges continue, also retained incident fees (paid per incident attended) would increase;
- Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and pay/employment-related);
- Increased workloads associated with redundancy and pay negotiation processes;
- Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest;
- Increased use of/reliance on the retained crews at the station and/or at nearby fire stations;
- Longer attendance times than previously during day (additional time for RDS crew to arrive at the station);
- Heavier reliance on maintaining full RDS cover in the area during the day (recruitment and retention challenge, potentially more difficult during day when people are in primary employment);
- Reduced Service capacity to undertake future (possibly new) duties/collaboration;
- Smaller pool of wholetime firefighters to progress into specialist/management roles.

**Remove day crewing allowances that are currently paid to day crewing firefighters**

Day crewed stations are at Holyhead, Caernarfon, Bangor, Llandudno and Colwyn Bay. Wholetime day crewing pay rates are higher than wholetime 24-hour shift pay rates.

From:

	2 X 1 = 2 WM A	£101,435
One day crewed appliance, 2 shifts	2 X 2 = 4 CM	£193,838
Plus RDS appliance (not costed here)	2 X 4 = 8 FF	£352,273
		<b>£647,546</b>

To:

	2 X 1 = 2 WM A	£90,296
One day crewed appliance, 2 shifts	2 X 2 = 4 CM	£171,988
Plus RDS appliance (not costed here)	2 X 4 = 8 FF	£310,260
		<b>£572,544</b>

**Savings per day crewed station:**

WM (allowances removed)	-£11,140
CM (allowances removed)	-£21,849
FF (allowances removed)	-£42,013
	<b>£75,002</b>

**OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)****Associated savings:**

-

**Legal implications:**

Need to ensure fair processes for removing allowances. Impact assessments would be required to ensure no equality issues.

**Potential for:**

- Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);
- Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the change;
- Predicted savings not achieved – e.g. only part-year savings achieved while discussions/challenges continued;
- Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and pay/employment-related);
- Increased workloads associated with pay negotiation processes;
- Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest.

<b>Close a retained fire station and/or remove the RDS appliance from one of the eight wholetime stations</b>			
There are 36 retained fire stations, and 8 wholetime fire stations that have a retained fire appliance in addition to a wholetime fire appliance. The wholetime fire stations are at Holyhead, Caernarfon, Bangor, Llandudno and Colwyn Bay (day crewed); Rhyl, Deeside and Wrexham (24-hour shift).			
From:	RDS	100% contract	75% contract
	1 X WM A	£6,960	£5,580
	2 X CM	£12,446	£10,628
	9 X FF	£50,517	£43,142
		<b>£69,922</b>	<b>£59,391</b>
To:	RDS	100% contract	75% contract
	0 X WM A	£0	£0
	0 X CM	£0	£0
	0 X FF	£0	£0
		<b>£0</b>	<b>£0</b>
<b>Savings per RDS appliance removed/RDS station closed:</b>			
In the region of £65,000 for retainer elements of pay (each would need individual calculation), but incident fees would still be payable to retained crews attending from elsewhere.			
<b>OTHER THINGS TO CONSIDER (EXAMPLES ONLY)</b>			
<b>Associated savings:</b>			
Fleet (e.g. cost of maintenance and replacement of 1 fire appliance and on-board equipment for each one).			
Staff (e.g. personal equipment, training, ICT and employment administration of around 14 per RDS crew).			
Buildings (e.g. maintenance, heating and lighting, water and other rates).			
<b>Legal implications:</b>			
Need to ensure fair processes for making staff redundant (consultation, selection criteria, business grounds for redundancy, alternatives, etc. Impact assessments required to identify equality/Welsh language issues.			
Need clear criteria for selecting stations to close/crews to remove to avoid challenges to proposals.			
<b>Potential for:</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Industrial action across whole area (not limited to affected station);</li> <li>• Local campaigning, press and social media interest in the closure/removal;</li> <li>• Differences of opinion about which RDS stations to close and which to keep;</li> <li>• Rural communities and large areas without a fire station;</li> <li>• Longer attendance times, including for incidents requiring more than one appliance to deal with the incident (effect on public safety and on safe systems of work for firefighters);</li> <li>• Predicted savings not achieved – perversely, because potential savings highest in RDS stations that are fully staffed and providing best rates of availability, they would need to be considered as part of the selection criteria to maximise the chances of actually achieving the predicted savings;</li> <li>• Legal costs associated with defending/implementing proposed changes (e.g. consultation-related and pay/employment-related);</li> <li>• Increased workloads associated with pay negotiation processes;</li> <li>• Increased workloads associated with managing public and media interest;</li> <li>• Increased workloads/costs associated with either selling off disused fire stations or maintaining the empty building in the meantime;</li> <li>• Reduced potential for local collaboration/community events in future and could end existing arrangements for sharing facilities with police and other partners;</li> <li>• Better retention rates as higher earnings for RDS crews attending more incidents <b>OR</b> worse retention rates as the increased activity more difficult to fit in with primary employment and other commitments.</li> </ul>			

## **Consultation: The Gunning Principles**

Whether or not there is a legal duty to consult, where consultation is carried out it must be done fairly. What is fair will depend on the circumstances of the case and the nature of the proposals under consideration.

Subject to the overall requirements of fairness, the decision-maker will have a broad discretion as to how consultation should be carried out, and what should be consulted upon.

The consultation must also comply with the following principles (termed the Gunning principles after the case in which they were set out, or the Sedley requirements after the barrister that suggested them in that case):

- Consultation must take place when the proposal is at a formative stage. Public authorities must have an open mind during consultation and must not have already made the decision, but may have some ideas about the proposal.
- Sufficient reasons must be put forward for the proposal so as to allow for intelligent consideration and response. Consultees must have enough information to be able to make an informed input to the process.
- Adequate time must be given for consideration and response. The timing and environment of the consultation must be appropriate, sufficient time must be given for people to develop an informed opinion and then provide feedback, and sufficient time must be given for the results to be analysed.
- The product of the consultation must be conscientiously taken into account.

It is prudent for a decision-maker to show in its decision that it has undertaken consultation and has given proper weight to the representations received. This may involve the decision-maker showing that it has understood the points being made by the responses and has considered them.

Acknowledgment: <http://law.gov.wales/constitution-government/public-admin/intro-admin-law/welsh-government-guidance-on-making-good-decisions/has-any-consultation-been-carried-out-fairly-and-properly/what-are-the-requirements-for-any-consultation-that-is-carried-out/?lang=en#/constitution-government/public-admin/intro-admin-law/welsh-government-guidance-on-making-good-decisions/has-any-consultation-been-carried-out-fairly-and-properly/what-are-the-requirements-for-any-consultation-that-is-carried-out/?tab=overview&lang=en>

**Summary timetable for producing the FRA's 2019/20 Plan**

DATE	MEETINGS	ACTION
January – March 2018	Planning Working Group	To undertake the detailed work associated with developing draft objectives for 2019/20 onwards (considering budgetary implications) for approval by the full FRA.
14/05/2018	Executive Panel	To agree recommendations to the full FRA in June 2018 for a draft consultation proposal based on options to address the anticipated budget shortfall.
18/06/2018	FRA	To consider recommendations from the Executive Panel and agree the basis of stakeholder and public consultation over the summer.
July – October 2018	Stakeholder and public consultation.	
22/10/2018	Executive Panel	To consider the response to the public consultation and agree recommendations to be presented to the full FRA in December 2018
17/12/2018	FRA	To agree the FRA's draft budget 2019/20 and the objectives to be incorporated into its draft 2019/20 Plan.
February 2019	Executive Panel	To consider the near final draft 2019/20 Plan for approval by the full FRA at its March meeting.
15/02/2019	Last day for notifying the constituent authorities of their financial contributions for 2019/20.	
March 2019	FRA	Final approval of the draft 2019/20 Plan for publication.
31/03/2019	Last day for publishing the FRA's 2019/20 Plan.	

## Appendix 5

Recent contributions from constituent local authorities towards the  
total cost of fire and rescue services in North Wales

£	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
Môn	3,236,545	3,219,270	3,216,231	3,198,669	3,200,523	3,190,812	3,330,579	3,356,175
Gwynedd	5,588,685	5,525,827	5,507,985	5,588,255	5,602,787	5,598,221	5,851,817	5,914,137
Conwy	5,240,568	5,206,959	5,198,570	5,283,704	5,289,891	5,277,177	5,539,433	5,589,830
Denbs	4,549,039	4,569,316	4,593,630	4,342,155	4,360,740	4,363,962	4,524,683	4,568,797
Flints	7,051,716	6,981,590	6,955,089	7,018,721	7,033,548	7,022,578	7,339,795	7,409,315
Wrexham	6,266,101	6,269,049	6,300,506	6,340,507	6,398,354	6,433,093	6,574,971	6,654,624
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>31,932,654</b>	<b>31,772,011</b>	<b>31,772,011</b>	<b>31,772,011</b>	<b>31,885,843</b>	<b>31,885,843</b>	<b>33,161,277</b>	<b>33,492,877</b>
Change		-160,643	0	0	+113,832	0	+1,275,434	+331,600
Population estimate	688,417	690,434	691,986	694,038	695,549	697,122	698,715	700,310
<b>£ per head</b>	<b>£47</b>	<b>£46</b>	<b>£46</b>	<b>£46</b>	<b>£46</b>	<b>£46</b>	<b>£47</b>	<b>£48</b>

North Wales 'constituent authorities' are: Isle of Anglesey County Council, Gwynedd Council, Conwy County Borough Council, Denbighshire County Council, Flintshire County Council and Wrexham County Borough Council.

**The North Wales Fire Services (Combination Scheme) Order 1995**

PART IV COMBINED FIRE SERVICE FUND

21.—(1) Each constituent authority shall, in respect of each financial year, pay into the combined fire service fund, in accordance with the provisions of this paragraph, a contribution equal to its appropriate proportion of the net expenses of the Authority in respect of that year.

(2) The Authority shall, before 31st December in any year, submit to each constituent authority an estimate of its net expenses for the next financial year, and shall subsequently, before 15th February, give notice to each constituent authority of the amount of the contribution to be paid by that authority under this paragraph in the next financial year.

Sub-paragraphs (3) – (5) deal with arrangements for making payments.

(6) The Authority may, after consultation with each constituent authority, revise the estimate referred to in sub-paragraph (2) at any time before the end of the financial year to which that estimate relates and shall, as soon as is practicable, give notice in writing to each constituent authority of the revised amount of the contribution to be paid by that authority under this paragraph.

Sub-paragraphs (7) – (8) deal with arrangements for interim payments.

(9) For the purposes of this paragraph the net expenses of the Authority, in respect of any financial year, shall be the amount of its expenditure in respect of that year less all income which is credited to the combined fire service fund in respect of that year, other than contributions paid or payable under sub-paragraph (1), but may, for the purposes of preparing the estimate referred to in sub-paragraph (2) and if the Authority so resolves, include such amount or amounts as the Authority considers appropriate with a view to minimising any upward revision of an estimate under sub-paragraph (6).

(10) In this paragraph—

- “appropriate proportion” means, in the absence of agreement between the constituent authorities, an amount determined by reference to the proportion which the population of the area of each constituent authority bears to the total population of the combined area, the population in any area being the number of persons usually resident in that area, as estimated by the Registrar General and indicated in the latest data available from him on 30th June in the year preceding the financial year referred to in sub-paragraph (1);

## **Summary of Planning Working Group 2018 meetings.**

The Planning Working Group met on five occasions – January 15<sup>th</sup>, February 5<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup>, March 5<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup>.

Members considered the likely challenges arising from an anticipated shortfall in the Authority's budget in 2019/20 and a range of possible approaches to ensuring sustainability of fire and rescue services in North Wales.

Members were provided with information from officers and reflected on a range of subject areas including:

- the Authority's planning responsibilities, specifically in respect of the Well-being of Future Generations Act;
- the importance of meaningful consultation with the public and other stakeholders before finalising strategic plans;
- the statutory duties of fire and rescue authorities in Wales:
  - promoting fire safety; fire-fighting; responding to road traffic accidents; and dealing with other prescribed emergencies;
  - removing chemical, biological or radio-active contaminants in an emergency; rescuing people trapped following the collapse of buildings or other structures; certain emergencies involving trains, trams or aircraft;
  - responding to flooding and inland water emergencies that present a risk of death, serious injury or serious illness to people;
  - being the enforcing authority in respect of the majority of non-domestic premises; and
  - being a 'category 1 responder' under the Civil Contingencies Act, with duties to assess the risk of emergencies occurring and to make and maintain appropriate plans;
- the extensive partnership working that goes on with other emergency services, local authorities and other agencies including the third sector;
- the FRA's *annual budgets since 2011/12*;
- the FRA's *past record of accommodating unavoidable cost increases by reducing services and making savings*;
- *what achieving a balanced budget in future might mean, given the potentially large budget deficit facing the FRA in 2019/20 and beyond*;
- the uncertainty around *unspecified changes that the Welsh Government would like to introduce in Welsh FRAs' governance and funding arrangements*;
- *fire stations and fire and rescue appliances in North Wales*;
- *operational activity levels*,
- *fire station availability*,
- *how mobilising decisions are made - the principles of pre-determined attendances to different types of incidents*;
- *the role of operational firefighters and national discussions about their future role*;



- the immediate pressure to balance the budget but the longer timescale for actually achieving large reductions in running costs;
- staff redundancy;
- how changes to services would be unlikely to be welcomed by the public, but that there would be an expectation from county councils that contributions can be kept low;
- the potential for industrial action in response to firefighter redundancies;
- the potential impact of reducing running costs by closing fire stations, removing fire appliances and changing staffing arrangements at different types of fire stations;
- the possible options for reducing the running costs of the fire and rescue service;
- the recent investment in firefighter apprentices and the difficulty of balancing redundancies alongside that investment;
- the implications of introducing new fire stations which would necessarily involve a large amount of work and planning, and would have to be considered in relation to retained duty system crews who need to live or work in close proximity to the fire station;
- how RDS fire stations with poor availability and which attend the fewest incidents would be the ones that produce the least savings;
- the importance of acting decisively and of not creating uncertainty by embarking on a proposed course of action without being fully committed to it; and
- the importance of involving staff and representative bodies in discussions about redundancies or if any changes to contractual terms of employment are proposed;
- changes made to the Service since 2011/12 in order to save money;
- the difficulty in implementing significant savings (over £250k) by as early as the start of the 2019/20 year.

### Summary of savings and efficiencies already achieved:

2011/12	
<p><b>Total contributions of £31,932,654.</b></p> <p>Year 1 of 3-year financial plan 2011/12 - 2013/14.</p> <p><b>Costs reduced by £800,000.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• £460,000 removed from the operational management budget by restructuring the officer cover arrangements.</li> <li>• £200,000 removed from specific budget lines by either discontinuing or scaling down planned spending.</li> <li>• £90,000 removed from the Support Staff budget.</li> <li>• £50,000 removed from the Community Fire Safety budget.</li> <li>• £30,000 removed from the Control budget by restructuring the department.</li> <li>• Costs of delivering the Business Fire Safety function reduced, including by transferring posts from grey book (operational) to green book (support staff) terms and conditions.</li> <li>• One of four Aerial Ladder Platforms removed from the Service's fleet.</li> <li>• <u>Other savings:</u></li> <li>• Keeping attendances at conferences down to a minimum.</li> <li>• Changing the way non-operational learning was provided.</li> <li>• Not funding Young Firefighter Association event.</li> <li>• Combining different awards ceremonies ..</li> </ul>
2012/13	
<p><b>Total contributions of £31,772,011</b> (£160,643 less than the previous year).</p> <p>Year 2 of 3-year financial plan 2011/12 - 2013/14.</p> <p><b>Savings of £815,000 made.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ·£500,000 removed from the operational firefighters' pay budget (22 wholetime posts) by changing the way working shifts were rostered but without affecting the number of firefighters in a crew.</li> <li>• ·£150,000 removed from specific budget lines by either discontinuing or scaling down planned spending.</li> <li>• ·£50,000 removed from the Community Fire Safety budget.</li> <li>• · Further £90,000 removed from the Support Staff budget.</li> </ul>
2013/14	
<p><b>Total contributions of 31,772,011</b> (the same as the previous year).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ·£500,000 removed from the operational firefighters' pay budget (as previous year).</li> <li>• · Wholtime firefighters allocated through an Operational Resource Pool to support day-to-day availability of Retained fire stations.</li> </ul>

<p>Year 3 of 3-year financial plan 2011/12 - 2013/14.</p> <p><b>Savings of £800,000 made.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• £70,000 removed from specific budget lines by either discontinuing or scaling down planned spending for a third time.</li> <li>• £50,000 removed from the Community Fire Safety budget.</li> <li>• £180,000 removed from the Support Staff budget.</li> </ul>
<b>2014/15</b>	
<p><b>Total contributions of £31,772,011</b> (budget frozen for another year).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decision taken to use financial reserves to cover any shortfall and so avoid introducing the large-scale cuts that would otherwise have been necessary. However, it was understood that this option would not be sustainable for longer than this one year.</li> </ul>
<b>2015/16</b>	
<p><b>Total contributions of £31,885,843</b> (increase of £113,000),</p> <p>£223,000 of reserves made available to cover shortfall.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• £16,000 of predicted savings from discontinuation of non-statutory services e.g. providing large animal rescues and line rescue incidents.</li> <li>• £35,000 saved by discontinuing non-statutory services (Atal Tân).</li> <li>• £25,000 of predicted savings from changing policy on responding to Automatic Fire Alarm calls. Actual savings were higher - cashable savings of £67,889.50 and non-cashable savings from more effective use of time for activities such as community safety.</li> <li>• £250,000 of potential savings by removing four middle management posts (flexible duty officers), reducing the number of such posts from 32 to 28.</li> <li>• New operational Management Structure (Sept 2015).</li> <li>• Introduction of new "WDS rural" contracts providing 21 hours per week.</li> </ul>
<b>2016/17</b>	
<p>Total contributions of <b>£31,885,843</b> (the same as the previous year).</p> <p>£454,000 of reserves made available to cover shortfall.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• May 2016 the Authority estimated that there would be a funding gap of £1.7million by 2018/19 and diminishing financial reserves. Although sympathetic to the financial pressures on most public services, also acknowledged the unavoidable cost pressures from pay and price inflation and changing government policy around pensions.</li> <li>• June 2016 the Authority estimated that there would be a funding gap of £2.26million by</li> </ul>

2019/20 and diminishing financial reserves. It did not consider that its strategy of continuing to freeze the budget was sustainable.

- The Executive Panel proposed that the Authority should adopt a new strategy from 2017/18 of combining higher contributions, reducing services and using reserves to cover any shortfall. This would mean a significant increase in contributions in 2017/18 but it would be followed by two years (2018/19 and 2019/20) without further increases in contributions.
- The planning working group looked how savings could be made to help keep county council contributions down and identified a potential £1,000,000 saving by removing a wholetime fire appliance from Wrexham (leaving one wholetime and one retained fire appliance there).
- October 2016 the Authority reflected on the fact that the Service had achieved £3million of savings and its workforce had been reduced by 9%, but to accommodate a 1% pay increase, the cost of the apprenticeship levy, the revenue cost of the capital budget and non-discretionary price inflation, the county council contributions would have to increase by £1.7million in 2017/18.
- December 2016 the Authority again reflected on the savings already achieved but the proposal to increase contributions by £1.7million in 2017/18 (which included a budget shortfall in 2016/17 of £740,000 which had been funded from reserves) was rejected. As an alternative, the Authority decided to increase the contributions by £1.28million in 2017/18 and then to increase them again by 1.3% in 2018/19 if necessary. Any shortfall in 2017/18 could be met from reserves.
- The Authority's intention was that preparations would begin in 2017 to reduce running costs by £1,000,000 from 2019/20 onwards. However, in March 2017 the possibility of pursuing £1,000,000 of savings with effect from 2019/20 by removing a fire appliance from Wrexham was abandoned when the Authority decided to withdraw the option and allow the new Authority after the May 2017 elections to make its own decisions

about its financial strategy.

**2017/18**

**Total contributions of £33,161,277** (an increase of £1,275,434).

£414,000 made available from reserves to cover shortfall.

**2018/19**

**Total contributions of £33,492,877** (an increase of £331,600).

£646,000 made available from reserves to cover shortfall.

- £366,000 saved annually by revising the Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) policy.
- December 2017 the Authority decided on an additional 1% (£331,600) in contributions for 2018/19 – less than the 1.3% mentioned in December 2016 and less than the 4.05% that would have met the total estimated costs in 2018/19 (as calculated before the MRP policy decision).